FAILURE OF ENLIGHTENMENT IN MODERN SOCIETY TO REVEAL GHOSTS IN THE DANCING VILLAGE ("DESA PENARI") BASED ON ADORNO'S CRITICAL THEORY

By
Denny Yerianto[1], Puji Lestari[2], Frengki Napitupulu[3]
[1,3]Universitas Sahid, Jakarta, Indonesia
[2]Universitas Pembangunan Nasional Veteran Yogyakarta, Indonesia
E-mail: [1]yerianto@gmail.com

Article Info	ABSTRACT
	The presence of the Enlightenment Era (Aufklarung) in the 18th century which emphasized rationality and reason, has not been able to eliminate the belief in ghosts in modern society. Currently, rationalization of ghosts is often found in books, television, films, and social media. Efforts to rationalize ghosts actually thwart enlightenment and lead modern society into the commodification of ghosts through the culture industry scheme. In Theodor W. Adorno's Critical Theory, the culture industry is always commercially oriented and makes ghosts a commodity to gain profit. The purpose of this study is to reveal why enlightenment has failed again in modern society by dismantling the commodification of ghosts. This study offers a solution to awaken modern society from false consciousness due to the rationalization of ghosts that are bound by the commodification of ghosts. This study is also expected to be able to renew Adorno's Critical Theory in the context of enlightenment in modern society, namely a different society when this theory was first proposed. Methodology of this study is a qualitative study using the netnography method with a critical paradigm. The object is modern society represented in 9,682 comments on the YouTube Channel "Kisah Tanah Jawa" episode "KKN Desa Penari". By using netnography and analysis of modern society conversation themes from the channel, this study shows the existence of sub-themes of standardization, massification, commodification and false consciousness which indicate the presence of the culture industry scheme. This study also shows how ghost symbols in the culture industry scheme have been produced through 4 approaches to ghost symbol production involving the help of science, technology, religion and rationalist narrative construction in forming false consciousness. This study also reveals the active role of modern society in encouraging the formation of ghost commodification. The result of this study show that society plays an important role in efforts to prevent the failure of enlightenment. True enlightenment is only possible if the relationship between text producers, text consumers, and capital owners is no longer dominated by the logic of capitalism. To achieve this, modern society needs to encourage decommodification of every ghost commodification that occurs and always develop critical awareness to reduce the occurrence of domination and exploitation behind the cultural products they consume to prevent the failure of enlightenment.

Corresponding Author:
Denny Yerianto
Universitas Sahid, Jakarta, Indonesia.
E-mail: yerianto@gmail.com

....

1. INTRODUCTION

The presence of the Enlightenment Era (Aufklarung) in the 18th century which prioritized rationality and science has not been able to eliminate the phenomenon of ghosts in modern society (Goldstein, 2007). The existence of ghosts is often considered as something irrational and cannot be proven scientifically. This irrationality often triggers people's curiosity, resulting in efforts to rationalize these phenomena. However, human efforts to rationalize the irrational often led humans to become more irrational. Theodor W. Adorno calls it the dilemma of rational humans (Sindhunata, 2021). Particularly, the existence of the Dancing Village ("Desa Penari") ghost phenomenon indicates a failure of enlightenment in modern society.

In the Modern era, ghosts are no longer discussed in a personal and taboo format in a limited space between shamans and patients, closed group discussions, and traditional communities. In the modern era, ghosts are discussed and broadcast openly through various media. Therefore, it is not surprising that modern society's belief in ghosts remains high (Baker & Bader, 2014; Mowen et al., 2022; Saputri, 2021). A survey from the Pew Research Center stated that 83% of Americans believe in the spirit world and 30% of them admitted to having met spirits or invisible spiritual forces (Alper et al., 2023). A survey from the Ipsos institution stated that 36% of Americans believe in ghosts (Poll, 2021). Meanwhile, a survey from the YouGove institution stated that 43% of Americans believe in ghosts (YouGove, 2021). These three data shows that modern society still strongly believes in ghosts.

The development of modern society is shaped by rational and scientific logic, but on the other hand, irrational ghosts persist in society. This irrational ghost are depicted through the cinema industry in Indonesia which are dominated by ghost-themed films from both within and outside the country. Based on the list of the 10 best-selling films according to Wikipedia in 2024, 6 out of 10 films are ghost themed. The number 1 ranking film is the film "KKN di Desa Penari" with more than 9 million viewers, far surpassing other films, this implies that society enthusiasm and positive response. The success of the film "KKN di Desa Penari" (showing in theaters starting April 30, 2022) cannot be separated from the viral story "KKN di Desa Penari" from the Twitter account (now "X") by SimpleMan @SimpleM81378523 on June 20, 2019. SimpleMan's text-format ghost story was transformed and adapted into a film by director Awi Suryadi, produced by MD Pictures and Pichouse Films. Several YouTube channels have made investigations into the ghosts of Desa Penari, one of the most popular being the investigation conducted by the YouTube Channel "KisahTanah Jawa". In the end, irrational ghosts are rationalized with the goal of making profits through the commodification of ghosts.

To gain profits through the commodification of ghosts, it is necessary to create ghost symbols that are rationally acceptable to society. They are constructed through various media including the internet. Through YouTube channels, people are inundated with information and discourse about the truth and existence of ghosts, making ghosts something rational. The film "KKN di Desa Penari" constructs the symbol of a dancing ghost named Badarawuhi. Badarawuhi is a beautiful female ghost of a snake spirit wearing traditional green Javanese clothing, complete with a crown, jewelry and a yellow scarf. The ghost of Badarawuhi might be scary and cruel, but it is made to seem logical so society can accept it. These ghost symbols were created to attract viewers and gain maximum profit (Sukarwo, 2022).

Due to the success of the ghost film "KKN Desa Penari", several YouTubers have made ghost investigation shows to Desa Penari in Banyuwangi, East Java. Om Hao from the YouTube Channel "Kisah Tanah Jawa" set foot on a location suspected of being Desa Penari and conducted mediumship. According to Om Hao, he met and was possessed by the ghost of Desa Penari that influenced him to perform their signature dance moves (Kisah Tanah Jawa, 2022). Meanwhile, the YouTube channel "Detektif Astral" also hunted the ghosts of Desa Penari using Willy and Jesslyn's long-distance supernatural abilities (Detektif Astral, 2022). According to culture industry theory, the success of film "KKN Desa Penari" and subsequent YouTube investigations commodifies ghost stories by transforming them into mass-produced, profit-driven entertainment.

According to Adorno's critical theory, the phenomenon of ghosts in the world of film and social media, reflects the failure of enlightenment that produces irrationality in a new form. The commodification of ghosts shows how capitalism can change all aspects of life, as even something irrational and invisible, can be turned into commodities. Meanwhile, false consciousness allows society to continue to be trapped in this irrational consumption, ignoring their actual material reality. The culture industry not only provides entertainment, but also shapes the way people think, making them passive in the face of exploitative social and economic structures that benefit the capitalist system. Therefore, Adorno's critical theory argues that enlightenment will always fail because instead of liberating society, it always creates new forms of domination and exploitation (Adorno & Horkheimer, 2014).

When Adorno delivered his critical theory of enlightenment and the culture industry (around the mid-20th century), society was still dominated by mass media such as radio, film, and television which were one-way (top-down). However, in 2025, social media has changed the way society interacts with information, culture, and power. Therefore, Adorno's critical theory needs to be improved to be relevant to the current conditions of society.

....

805

....

The purpose of this study is to dismantle the commodification of ghosts to reveal why enlightenment has failed again in modern society. Through this study, it is hoped that it can awaken modern society from false consciousness due to efforts to rationalize ghosts that are shackled by the commodification of ghosts. This study is also expected to be able to perfect Adorno's critical theory in the context of enlightenment in modern society.

2. LITERATUR REVIEW

The culture industry has shifted society's view of ghosts from a spiritual mythological concept to an economic concept in the form of commodification (Sukarwo, 2022). Fear of ghost symbols is transformed into a recreation of fear where the audience is positioned as consumers in the culture industry so that it has economic value and is then commodified and repeated in production so as to increase the economic value that benefits capital owners (Setyaningsih, 2023; Al-Ulya & Budiman, 2018). Ghosts have shifted from myths to mere cultural commodities produced through the culture industry scheme (Sukarwo, 2022).

Modern society tries to rationalize ghosts by searching for information in various media. On the other hand, a number of other researchers have studied how ghost hunters reconstruct ghost symbols to meet the information needs of the community (Eaton, 2019; Smith, 2018; Koven, 2007; Pratiwi, 2020; Saputri, 2021). The trust that arises in modern society between producers and consumers of text on ghosts gives rise to elements of power and economic interests that lead to commodification, which can be seen in the YouTube show "Jurnal Risa" by Risa Saraswati (Pratiwi, 2020). Saputri (2021) explains further how these ghosts are deconstructed so that they can be rationalized by society and eventually gain profits for capital owners. Adorno's critical theory argues that enlightenment will always fail because instead of liberating humans, it always creates new forms of domination and exploitation, such as totalitarianism and capitalism (Adorno & Horkheimer, 2014).

In contrast to Adorno, Jurgen Habermas maintains his belief in the potential of enlightenment. He criticizes the pessimistic views of Adorno and Horkheimer, stating that enlightenment still has the potential to achieve human emancipation through communicative rationality and a democratic public sphere. Habermas believes that despite failures, society should not give up on the spirit of enlightenment, but must continue to improve it (schmidt, 1982).

Christian Fuch calls modern society a communicative society, namely a society that is controlled together (Fuchs, 2019). Don Tapscot calls modern society a society that is free, open, innovative, has many choices, is critical, values integrity, is collaborative, is rich in information, and wants everything as fast as possible (Tapscot, 2009).

Adorno's critical theory remains relevant but needs to be improved by considering the dynamics of modern society such as the dynamics of the public sphere of modern society on social media and digital capitalism. Instrumental rationality now works through algorithms, data, and the attention economy, not just the classic culture industry. Therefore, an updated critical theory must include changes in the interactions of modern society and how false consciousness is now formed through the interaction of symbols in modern society.

3. METHODS

The paradigm of the study used is the critical paradigm. (Poespowardojo & Seran, 2016) stated that the critical paradigm has the character of always being suspicious and critical of society, thinking historically and not separating theory and practice. With this critical character, it is hoped that it can provide awareness for society to dismantle the shackles of capitalism on the ghost phenomenon.

A critical approach to the study of culture and society will carefully record the reality of human life that is constructed through communication. Unlike other approaches, the critical approach focuses more on the macro context such as social reality, politics, and economic issues that influence cultural communication, especially the power relations in it (Lestari & Ruliana, 2019). Critical theory in communication science does not stop at just understanding power but it will actively try to change it in a better and more positive way (Napitupulu et al., 2019; Ronda, 2018)

Critical ethnography (which includes netnography) is increasingly developing as a method of studying community culture that uses a critical paradigm (Budiasa, 2016). Unlike other ethnographies, critical ethnography contains political content to reveal the occurrence of unfair cultures, marginalized cultures, exploitation, and subordination. Critical ethnography not only describes a culture in depth but also provides criticism and offers solutions about what society should do (Cresswell, 2013; Budiasa, 2016).

Meanwhile, the study method used is a qualitative study method. This method is useful for finding problems and potentials, understanding the meaning and uniqueness of the object being studied, understanding social processes and/or interactions, understanding people's feelings, constructing understanding and finding hypotheses, ensuring the truth of data and researching the history of development (Sugiyono & Lestari, 2021).

This study analyzes and critiques Modern Society on digital society on the YouTube Channel "Kisah Tanah Jawa" in the episode "Fenomena Desa Penari" published on May 27, 2022. The YouTube channel is a popular

....

....

YouTube channel that features investigative videos of ghosts on the island of Java, Indonesia. The episode of the ghost of Desa Penari was chosen because it is a ghost in the film "KKN di Desa Penari" which is the best-selling film of all time in Indonesia. The analysis was carried out on community conversations that occurred in the comments column of the YouTube channel, which amounted to 9,682 comments. For this reason, the qualitative study method used is netnography. Netnography is a form of qualitative study that seeks to understand cultural experiences that include and are reflected in digital traces, practices, and online trace systems (Eriyanto, 2021). Online traces can be in the form of text, graphics, photography, audiovisuals, music, commercial advertisements and many other things. This cultural experience can be obtained by involving researchers and then reflected through three basic elements of netnography: investigation, interaction, and immersion (Kozinets, 2020).

The stages of this netnography research begin by watching YouTube "Kisah Tanah Jawa" and reading the conversations that arise in the comments. Each conversation that arises will be analyzed (using theme analysis method) and coded in 3 stages, namely open, axial, and selective coding . Coding is the process of giving codes or labels to conversation data that is relevant to the research question. The code will describe a summary of the conversation data obtained. This data conceptualization stage is often referred to as open coding. Furthermore, researchers will identify and see the relationship between concepts such as relationships, similarities or differences. This stage basically places the data back by making connections between concepts where the relationship between concepts can be in the form of causal relationships, context phenomena, actions-interactions or consequences that will later form categories. This stage is often referred to as axial coding. The last is the selective coding stage which will select categories and connect them to the themes and theories used, in this case the theory used from Theodor Adorno.

The stages above will provide an understanding of modern society in viewing the ghost phenomenon, as part of society according to ethnographic rules. Then from this understanding the process will be continued by criticizing and freeing the rationality of society from false consciousness. The steps to criticize modern society for the occurrence of ghost commodification using analysis based on Theodor Adorno's thoughts on the dialectic of enlightenment and the culture industry.

The validity of the data in this study was carried out using a credibility test with triangulation techniques with secondary sources such as books, journals, and other documentation including videos and online interviews. Testing the validity and reliability of this qualitative research refers to the standard goodness criteria by Cresswell (2017) which is through credibility, transferability, dependability and confirmability. Also using the standard goodness criteria from Guba and Lincold (1989) for the critical paradigm, namely providing historical context, eliminating ignorance and misunderstanding, stimulating action.

4. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

On May 27, 2022, the YouTube Channel "Kisah Tanah Jawa" uploaded a travel video to Penari Village titled "Fenomena Desa Penari". At the time this travel video was uploaded, people were still busy talking about the ghost in the cinema film entitled "KKN di Desa Penari" which was shown in cinemas since April 30, 2022, and became the highest-grossing film of all time in Indonesia, with 10,061,033 viewers. When this video was downloaded on April 1, 2023, it had been watched by more than 4,567,450 viewers. Even though this channel has only around 2,570,000 registered subscribers or customers, it does not mean that this video can only be watched and commented on by subscribers, but the general public (not subscribers) can also access this channel. This YouTube channel is open to access and comment.

To see the phenomenon of ghosts in modern society, especially ghosts in Penari Village, this study uses comment data containing 9,682 comments from the YouTube Channel "Kisah Tanah Jawa" on the episode "Fenomena Desa Penari". The data obtained from the community conversations that occurred were processed and analyzed further to explore the hidden meaning of communication and culture from the community. The data analysis technique used in this netnography method is thematic analysis. Thematic analysis is a method of data analysis by building themes or topics. These themes are found inductively from the data (Eriyanto, 2021).

The researcher began by processing conversations in the form of 9,682 comments from the YouTube Channel "Kisah Tanah Jawa". According to Eriyanto (2021), for research purposes, not all the data has to be used, where the researcher only took 2175 comments selected based on the level of engagement (number of likes and number of replies). Furthermore, each comment is given a label or code based on thematic analysis. Comments that have the same theme will be grouped into the same code. There are 45 codes created based on thematic analysis of 2175 comments. From the 45 codes analyzed and grouped to form an abstract category which is a unification of concepts from previous codes. From the abstraction process, it is then linked to the theory that will be used. The categories found are the categories of standardization, massification, commodification and false consciousness.

....

....

Through netnography and theme analysis methods, it was found that the conversation of modern society about the ghost of Desa Penari culminates in a conversation about standardization, massification, commodification and false consciousness where according to Adorno these four things are characteristics of the culture industry.

Standardization. This study found that there were similarities in the form of the Badarawuhi ghost between the sketch image and the form of the Badarawuhi ghost in the film, which can be concluded as a standardization of the ghost symbol. Likewise, with the similarity of dance movements in the mediumization performed by Om Hao (Host) and the dance movements of the Badarawuhi ghost in the film. In the video and visual displays, no video captures of the figure of the Badarawuhi ghost were found so that the reality of the ghost is suspected to be a reconstruction following existing ghost standards.

The storyline built by the YouTube Channel "Kisah Tanah Jawa" has similarities to the storyline in the Cinema Film. This is in line with the thinking of the culture industry which tends to produce stories that follow established formulas and standards that sell well. Ghosts are always considered evil creatures and must be destroyed while showing human dominance over other creatures.

To achieve profit and a wider market, the culture industry tends to produce similar and uniform works. Standardization causes the loss of originality, including the loss of the originality of the ghost story that should be. In addition, this standardization is a way for the culture industry to manipulate the tastes and desires of society for the sake of mass production. By creating mass-produced and uniform works, the culture industry can control the market and direct consumer preferences that often lead to the goal of achieving greater profits for capital owners.

Massification. Adorno uses the term massification to describe the process by which the culture industry produces uniform, homogeneous products aimed at the general mass taste. This concept refers to the elimination of uniqueness, originality, and complexity in cultural products due to mass production efforts to reach a wider market. In the context of stories in films and YouTube channels, massification can occur in several ways, such as similar story formulas and following established formulas. In the ghost story of Desa Penari, it uses a plot of humans who violate the taboos of a certain area and receive punishment from the ghost of Desa Penari.

Efforts at massification can also be seen from the ghost story on the YouTube Channel "Kisah Tanah Jawa" which is linked to the story of the lives of modern society (not village society). The story uses the setting of student life and romantic conflicts spiced with infidelity to reach a wider market.

This massification encourages the reduction of cultural experiences so that they become simpler and more common experiences to reach a wider market. Ghosts that have noble cultural values are only seen as something scary and frightening to society, to meet the tastes of society and the market.

Commodification. Commodification is done by utilizing the utility values of ghosts in society which are then transformed into cultural products that can be mass produced, traded, and consumed. The utility values of fear, curiosity, spiritual values, communal identity, and education of the ghosts of Penari Village are transformed into video shows on the YouTube Channel "Kisah Tanah Jawa". Then, the show provides commercial value for the manager of the YouTube channel and the owner of YouTube.

False consciousness. The concept of false consciousness is a false or mistaken understanding that individuals or groups have of their own circumstances, social life, or power structures in society. In this context, false consciousness makes people unaware of the real situation and sometimes makes them maintain a system that oppresses or harms them. The rationality that should free society from the darkness of ignorance becomes a source of domination and control under this false consciousness.

False enlightenment where knowledge and rationality that should liberate society, are instead used to control and manipulate them. This false enlightenment is what creates false consciousness in society, leading to a distorted and manipulative understanding of reality. The reason modern society accepts the irrational rationality of ghosts is because ghosts are presented logically to modern society. From this study ghosts are presented using a logical scientific narrative, religious narrative, technological proof, and with a logical constructive narrative in the style of modern society.

The role of shamans in modern society is increasingly shunned. Instead, modern society believes more in new figures in society such as educated people, artists, and paranormals where they are close to technology. From the Top 5 ghost shows on YouTube channels in the West and in Indonesia, no shaman figures were found. The similarity in modern perspectives (from YouTube Channel managers) makes modern society believe more in the figure of paranormal artists so that what is conveyed can be directly accepted. Consequently, just because they feel enlightened, people become easily convinced without having to check their rationality. Ultimately, society accepted and even defended "false enlightenment" as the new truth.

....

808

International Journal of Social Science (IJSS)
Vol.4 Issue.6 April 2025, pp: 803-810
ISSN: 2798-3463 (Printed) | 2798-4079 (Online)

....

False consciousness is the result of the dominance of the culture industry that produces products that normalize capitalism and distract from social injustice. False consciousness creates new needs in society, which are not needed - in the language of millennials and Gen Z it is called FOMO or fear of missing out.

The role of ghost symbols in commodification. Modern rational society does not reject ghosts (which are irrational) but instead tries to rationalize these ghosts. This study looks at 4 approaches to the production of ghost symbols that occur in modern society, namely approaches that involve the help of science, technology, and religion as well as the construction of rationalist narratives. Society not only consumes ghost symbols but also helps reproduce ghost symbols in their conversations on YouTube, using these approaches.

The enlightenment carried out by modern society in uncovering the mystery of ghosts, experiences a paradox. This is what the theory of enlightenment calls the efforts of modern society to uncover ghosts are myths. Because efforts to uncover ghosts actually trap society into endless new searches, which are then exploited by capitalism. The success of the YouTube show "Fenomena Desa Penari" was continued with the broadcast of the next episode "Behind the Scenes of the Journey of the Story of the Land of Java". Then the stories of other ghosts on the YouTube Channel "Kisah Tanah Jawa" were produced into cinema films, such as the latest cinema film produced by MD Pictures entitled "Pocong Gundul" (2023) and the film "Badarawuhi in Desa Penari" (2024).

The market and capitalist logic direct and manipulate cultural products, including the production of ghost symbols as part of culture. Ghost symbols are produced not only to maintain cultural values or enlighten society, but also to meet market demand and make a profit.

The role of modern society in commodification. Initially, the ghost of the Desa Penari was a ghost owned and known by the local community but went viral on the internet. The role of modern society on the internet is very large in reproducing the symbol of the Desa Penari ghost. The ghost of the Desa Penari, which was originally a utility value for the local community (as a ghost guarding the sustainability of the village forest), has been changed into exchange value. Capitalism is present to complement the change in utility value into exchange value for the ghost of the Desa Penari by encouraging reproduction through films, books, YouTube and other media.

With the characteristics of modern society above, the production and consumption of ghost symbols become dynamic. Domination and control are no longer entirely owned by producers and capital owners. Consumers can give appreciation by subscribing, liking and viewing which can increase income for the producers of the show. But consumers can also punish producers by unsubscribing, disliking which can result in lower income for the producers of the show. Consumers can even punish by switching to another producer or leaving and not subscribing to YouTube.

The active role of modern society in the commodification of the culture industry is not only watching shows, but also actively carrying out activities that benefit producers such as watching repeatedly, actively promoting shows to other people, encouraging trending, providing criticism, and suggestions in comments, and even providing rebuttals and defenses from other consumers. Unwittingly, the active participation of modern society has become part of capitalist marketing, free and voluntary.

Awareness Agenda. To avoid the failure of enlightenment due to the domination and exploitation of capitalism against society, this study proposes an awareness agenda for modern society, namely:

1. Revealing false consciousness created by the culture industry. Awareness must be done by inviting the public to understand that the ghost symbols consumed are merely commercial constructions, not realities that must be believed in.
2. Encouraging critical thinking about what is consumed from the culture industry. Awareness is done by inviting the public not to accept the production of ghost symbols as something true without questioning the motives behind it.
3. Suspecting the economic motives behind the commodification of ghosts. The public needs to understand that what they consume is not always a supernatural reality, but rather there are economic motives by exploiting the fear of the public.
4. Be aware of the pleasure of false consciousness. False consciousness is not only created by capital owners alone. Producers and consumers can be actively involved in creating and enjoying false consciousness to support the creation of commodification or achieve enlightenment.
5. Fighting false consciousness. The public must realize that they have the power to not always be oppressed and dominated by capitalism. The public must realize that they are able to free themselves from capitalism.

To follow up on the agenda of raising awareness in modern society, capital owners, text producers, and text consumers must carry out emancipatory enlightenment!

Emancipatory Enlightenment. Critical theory demands that the implementation of theory and practice cannot be separated and must encourage the creation of human liberation from the domination and exploitation of fear. Christian Fuch calls modern society a communicative society, namely a society that is controlled together (Fuchs, 2019). For this reason, this study offers a solution to awareness in the form of enlightenment that frees from the shackles

....

of capitalism using the scheme of the decommodification process of capital owners, producers and consumers of texts. In simple terms, the decommodification process is a process of normalization of commodification carried out by the dominant party. For example, text producers dominate text consumers, then text consumers must normalize text producers using the awareness agenda described earlier. Cancel culture is an example of the normalization of text producers by text consumers. Cancel culture is the attitude or action of a person or group, especially on social media, to reject or stop supporting and idolizing someone due to their inappropriate or offensive words or actions (Altamira & Movementi, 2023). Cancel culture on the YouTube Channel "Kisah Tanah Jawa" can be carried out by text consumers such as unsubscribing, negative comments, giving disliked status so that text producers consider the text that has been submitted (if it is considered not enlightening or lying). YouTube Channel Owners (text producers) can fight YouTube (capital owners) for inappropriate policies, such as giving negative comments, moving content to other media (television, podcasts, other platforms). All of this forms a decommodification scheme that will normalize the commodification that occurs and will encourage the creation of true enlightenment.

5. CONCLUSION

This study found that enlightenment on the phenomenon of ghosts in modern society has been ridden by capitalism in the form of ghost commodification. The culture industry scheme that is present through standardization, massification, and commodification has succeeded in creating false consciousness in the production and consumption of ghost symbols in modern society.

In contrast to Adorno's previous thoughts, the novelty is seen in the involvement of the active role of modern society in encouraging the formation of ghost commodification and false consciousness. For this reason, the active role of modern society, both text producers, text consumers and capital owners, is one of the keys to avoiding the failure of enlightenment. Society must be critical in opposing the domination and exploitation carried out by capitalism.

True enlightenment is only possible if the relationship between text producers, text consumers, and capital owners is no longer dominated by the logic of capitalism. To achieve this, modern society needs to encourage decommodification of every ghostly commodification that occurs and continuously develop critical awareness to reduce the occurrence of domination and exploitation behind the cultural products they consume to prevent the failure of enlightenment.

REFERENCES

[1] Adorno, T. W., & Horkheimer, M. (2014). Dialektika Pencerahan: Mencari Identitas Manusia Rasional (Terjemahan). IRCiSoD.

[2] Altamira, M.B., & Movementi, S.G. (2023) "Fenomena Cancel Culture Di Indonesia: Sebuah Tinjauan Literatur," Jurnal Vokasi Indonesia: Vol. 10: No. 1, Article 5. DOI: 10.7454/jvi.v10i1.1177

[3] Available at: https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/jvi/vol10/iss1/5

[4] Al-Ulya, K., & Budiman, R. (2018). Monster Global, Ketakutan Lokal: Kisah Hantu dan Ingatan Kolektif Warga Kota. Jurnal Makna, 3(1), 1–19.

[5] Alper, B. Y. B. A., Rotolo, M., Tevington, P., Nortey, J., & Kallo, A. (2023). Spirituality Among Americans. https://www.pewresearch.org/religion/2023/12/07/spirituality-among-americans/

[6] Baker, J. O., & Bader, C. D. (2014). A social anthropology of ghosts in twenty-first-century America. Social Compass, 61(4), 569–593. https://doi.org/10.1177/0037768614547337

[7] Budiasa, I. M. (2016). Paradigma dan Teori dalam Etnografi Baru dan Etnografi Kritis. Prosiding Seminar Nasional Paradigma Dan Teori-Teori Komunikasi Dalam Ilmu Komunikasi, 1, 9–24. http://ihdnpress.ihdn.ac.id

[8] Cresswell, J. W. (2013). Qualitatif Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approachs (Third). SAGE.

[9] Detektif Astral (19 Mei 2022). Menguak KKN Desa Penari, mencari Badarawuhi malah ketemu kerajaan jin "Sidarwuhi". [Video]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Be_AG5PS2KY

[10] Eaton, M. A. (2019). Manifesting Spirits: Paranormal Investigation and the Narrative Development of a Haunting. Journal of Contemporary Ethnography, 48(2), 155–182. https://doi.org/10.1177/0891241618756162

[11] Eriyanto. (2021). Metode Netnografi. Remaja Rosdakarya.

[12] Fuchs, C. (2019). RereadingMarx in the Age of Digital Capitalism. Pluto Press.

[13] Goldstein, D. E. (2007). Haunting Experiences: Ghosts in Contemporary Folklore.

[14] Guba, E.G. & Y.S. Lincoln (1989). Fourth Generation Evaluation. London: Sage Publications.

[15] Kisah Tanah Jawa (27 Mei 2022). Fenomena Desa Penari. [Video]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Nx3X8jpX8m4&t=11s

....

[16] Kisah Tanah Jawa (31 Mei 2022). Di Balik Layar Perjalanan Kisah Tanah Jawa Di Desa Penari. [Video]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hQb79Hg2zNM&t=80s

[17] Koven, M. J. (2007). Most haunted and the convergence of traditional belief and popular television. Folklore, 118(2), 183–202. https://doi.org/10.1080/00155870701337403

[18] Kozinets, R. V. (2020). Netnography: The Essential Guide to Qulitative Social Media Research. (Third). Sage Publications.

[19] Lestari, P., & Ruliana, P. (2019). Teori Komunikasi. Rajawali Pers.

[20] Mowen, T. J., Heitkamp, A., & Boman, J. (2022). Paranormal Activity: Self-control Theory and Belief in the Paranormal. Deviant Behavior, 43(6), 728–742. https://doi.org/10.1080/01639625.2021.1915723

[21] Napitupulu, F., Ronda, M., & Dua, M. (2019). Commodification of Pilgrimage to the Holy Land of Jerusalem Critical Study of Spiritual Tourism and the Advertising Power Based on Adorno's Critical Theory. Journal of Education, Society and Behavioural Science, 29(2), 1–10. https://doi.org/10.9734/jesbs/2019/v29i230101

[22] Poespowardojo, M. S., & Seran, A. (2016). Diskursus Teori-Teori Kritis, Kritik atas Kapitalisme Klasik, Moderen dan Kontemporer. Kompas Media Nusantara.

[23] Poll, I. (2021). Over a third of Americans believe in ghosts and U. F. O's. 1–7.

[24] Pratiwi, D. A. (2020). Demistifikasi dalam Jurnal Risa (Diskursus Mistisisme dalam Beberapa Konten Youtube Jurnalrisa).

[25] Ronda, A. M. (2018). Tafsir Kontemporer Ilmu Komunikasi: Tinjauan Teoritis, Epistemologi, Aksiologi Andi Mirza Ronda (R. Diana (ed.)). Indigo Media.

[26] Saputri, N. A. (2021). Dekonstruksi Hantu dalam Media Digital Berdasarkan Perspektif Derrida. Komunika, 8(2), 87–106. https://doi.org/10.22236/komunika.v8i1.5669

[27] Schmidt, J. (1982). Jürgen Habermas and the Difficulties of Enlightenment. Social Research, 49(1), 181–208. http://www.jstor.org/stable/40970858

[28] Setyaningsih, T. R. I. W. (2023). Rekreasi Ketakutan: Jurnal Imaji, 14(1), 57–72. https://doi.org/10.52290/i.v14i1.100

[29] Sindhunata. (2021). Dilema Usaha Manusia Rasional: Teori Kritis Sekolah Frankfurt (Cetakan ke). Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

[30] Smith, M. (2018). Ghost Hunting in the New Millennium : A Trans-Media Theory of Cycle Studies.

[31] Sugiyono, & Lestari, P. (2021). Metode Kajian Komunikasi. Penerbit Alfabeta.

[32] Sukarwo, W. (2022). Industri Budaya dan Banalitas Spiritual pada Hantu. Kibar, 323–329. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.30998/kibar.27-10-2022.6327

[33] Tapscot, D. (2009). Grown Up Digital, Yang Muda Yang Mengubah Dunia. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

[34] YouGov. (2021, Oktober 22). Two in five Americans say ghosts exist — and one in five say they've encountered one. YouGov.com https://today.yougov.com/entertainment/articles/38919-americans-say-ghosts-exist-seen-a-ghost

....